

Chullin – Simanim

פרק ז – גיד הנשה

דף צג – 93 Daf

1. *Cheilev* of the flanks covered by meat is permitted

Shmuel says: חלב שהבשר חופה אותו מותר – the section of *cheilev* (of the flanks) *which is covered by meat is permitted*, because the *passuk* only prohibits *cheilev* שעל הכסלים – *which is on* (the surface of) *the flanks*, ולא שבתוך הכסלים, *but not* the חלב *which is in the flanks*. The Gemara objects that Shmuel himself ruled that the fats beneath the loins are prohibited, even though they are covered by meat!? Abaye answered: בהמה בחייה פרוקי מיפרקא – *while an animal is alive*, [its limbs] *separate* from each other as it walks, periodically exposing that fat. Rebbe Yochanan also said, “I am neither a butcher nor the son of a butcher, but I recall that they would say this in the בית מדרש: while an animal is alive, its limbs separate from each other, leaving חלב uncovered.

2. Penalties for a butcher who sold meat containing *cheilev*

The Gemara states: טבח שנמצא חלב אחריו – concerning *a butcher after whom cheilev was found* (i.e., sold meat without fulfilling his responsibility to remove all the חלב), Rav Yehudah says he is punished בבשעורה – if the meat contained a mere *barleycorn’s volume* of חלב. Rebbe Yochanan requires a כזית of חלב. Rav Pappa says they do not argue: Rebbe Yochanan’s measure of a כזית is להלקותו – *to give him lashes* (a Rabbinic punishment for causing others to sin), whereas Rav Yehudah’s smaller measure of a כשעורה is לעברו – *to remove him* from being allowed to sell meat. Mar Zutra says that the measure of a כשעורה applies to חלב found in one place, while the measure of a כזית applies to חלב found in two or three places. The *halachah* is that the measure for lashes is a כזית, and a כשעורה warrants removing a butcher from his position.

3. Changing policy re: trusting butchers to remove the גיד הנשה

In the Mishnah on Daf 89b, Rebbe Meir said that butchers are not trusted to remove the entire גיד הנשה, but the Chochomim say they are trusted. Rebbe Yochanan says חזרו לומר נאמנין – *they later reversed their ruling to say that [butchers] are trusted*. This implies they initially were not trusted, and Rav Nachman asks: אבשור דרי – *have the generations improved*, that the butchers have become more trustworthy?! The Gemara explains that initially, they ruled like Rebbe Meir, that removing the גיד הנשה requires “digging after it” and removing even embedded offshoots (as presented on the previous Daf), and butchers could not be trusted to carry out this painstaking task. Later, they retracted and ruled like Rebbe Yehudah, who only required removing the surface section of the גיד הנשה, and butchers could be relied upon to do so. In another version, butchers initially were trusted to remove the גיד הנשה and חלב, because they initially held like Rebbe Yehudah. Later, they ruled like Rebbe Meir, and as long as the butchers remembered the former lenient ruling, they could not be trusted to follow Rebbe Meir’s stringent opinion. Eventually, when Rebbe Yehudah’s position was forgotten, the butchers could be trusted.

Siman – Train Chugging Along

Roast Beef Railroad, which served sandwiches with *cheilev* from the flanks that were covered by meat and didn’t allow certain butchers onboard because they were caught selling a כשעורה-sized portion of forbidden חלב, was full of new recruits to the business now that butchers were trusted to remove the גיד הנשה.

דף צג | DAF 93

Train Chugging Along



Roast Beef Railroad, which served sandwiches with *cheilev* from the flanks that were covered by meat, and didn't allow certain butchers onboard because they were caught selling a שיעורה-sized portion of forbidden חלב, was full of new recruits to the business now that butchers are trusted to remove the גיד הנשה.

3 things to remember

1. *Cheilev* of the flanks covered by meat is permitted
2. Penalties for a butcher who sold meat containing *cheilev*
3. Changing policy re: trusting butchers to remove the גיד הנשה

